



**Highways & Transportation Briefing Note – non
technical analysis**

**In respect of the hybrid planning application at South Quay &
Foundry Yard, Hayle Harbour
Application Reference PA/08142**

**Submitted for Information Purposes Only
(July 2011)**

Introduction

The purpose of this Briefing Note is to provide information and data to Members about the redevelopment of South Quay and Foundry Yard in Hayle.

ING, a major European financial institution, proposes to regenerate the South Quay and Foundry Yard sites. The scheme would be a sensitive development comprising retail, residential, restaurant and community uses. An application for this purpose was submitted to Cornwall County Council on 9 December 2010, LPA Reference PA10/08142. It was submitted as a 'Hybrid' (Part in Outline, part in detail). The retail elements (foodstore and non-food on Foundry Yard Car Park) were the detailed elements. The proposal for South Quay incorporated a 5230m² foodstore, 30 homes, a restaurant, and a cinema. The proposal for the Foundry Yard site is for 1990m² (Gross Internal Area) of non food retail and location of the Goonvean Engine. The development proposed on South Quay and Foundry Yard is referred to in this document as the 'Current Proposal'.

These sites already have the benefit of an outline planning consent for development, referred to as the 'Consented Masterplan' (LPA Ref 08-0613). A calculation of the peak period traffic shows that the movement associated with the Current Proposal will be significantly less at Foundry Square than that for the Consented Masterplan due to the reduced scale of the proposals. The Current Proposal therefore brings forward an opportunity to deliver immediate regeneration of this part of the town centre with less transport impact on the highway network than that associated with the Consented Masterplan.

As a result of the ongoing consultation between the Council and the ING team since the decision to defer the application in February 2011, the quantum of development now proposed (Proposed Amendments) has evolved since the December 2010 Transport Assessment (TA). Consequently, there is now a reduction in total floorspace compared to the Current Proposals.

Key Benefits

The Current Proposal delivers the following benefits;

- A new 3m wide pedestrian / cycle bridge over Penpol Creek. The Council in consultation with the local community is currently considering whether the location highlighted on the submitted application drawings is the most appropriate. The position of the bridge is subject to securing all necessary approvals and ING will be offering to make a financial contribution secured through the S106 legal agreement. Should an alternative location be deemed more suitable then the financial contribution can be used for this purpose and a revised permission can be sought;
- It provides high quality retail facilities as an extension to Hayle town centre, thereby reducing the need to travel to other towns and out of centre facilities for shopping needs, thus reducing the level of traffic on the Strategic Road Network.
- There would be 15% less traffic than the Consented Masterplan at Foundry Square
- It gives more traffic capacity at Foundry Square as a result of some very minor, yet sensitive adjustments to the geometry of the junction.

- Continuous, new, high quality and attractive pedestrian and cycle linkages through the development will be provided, thereby enhancing the accessibility of the development. Cycle parking spaces will be provided across the development for public use.
- A reduction in parking of 150 spaces compared to the consented scheme for South Quay.
- It would introduce a parking strategy that provides for short term stays whilst preventing vehicles blocking back onto Carnsew Road together with no reduction in existing on street parking availability within Hayle.

Policy

The development fully complies with National and Local policy. It also offers significant benefits to the pedestrian environment and connectivity to the town centre highlighting the fact that the South Quay site is the most suitable and sustainable site on which to locate a food superstore within Hayle.

This is particularly relevant given the proposed out of town and unsustainable location for food retail as proposed by ASDA. In basic planning policy terms the ING site is also preferable to the Morrison's application which is further from the town centre than the ING proposal and is extremely constrained in terms of providing the required level of pedestrian/cycle connectivity with the town centre.

The proposed redevelopment of South Quay will integrate with the existing town centre, providing an improved public realm and new retail floorspace for the local community. The impact of this will mean that more local residents will be able to shop within Hayle for food and comparison goods, thereby reducing vehicular trips on the wider Strategic Highway Network, namely the A30.

In addition, the close proximity of the development to the local community means that travel by sustainable modes is a real alternative to travel by private car, thereby reducing the amount of primary trips on the local highway network. The public realm improvements and South Quay regeneration will provide wider benefits for the local residents of Hayle, including improved social inclusion, transport infrastructure, pedestrian environment and long-term vitality of the local economy.

In summary the site is located in a sustainable, sequentially preferable town centre location which is easily accessible by a wide variety of travel modes. As such it complies with the national and regional sustainable transport and land-use policies and compares much more favourably in this regard to the out of town foodstore proposals within Hayle.

Traffic Attraction of Consented Masterplan, Current Proposal and Proposed Amendments

Whilst the Current Proposal contains a foodstore, there is an overall reduction of 55% floorspace compared with the Consented Masterplan for South Quay. The Current Proposal also has some 150 less car parking spaces than the Consented Masterplan. This represents a significant reduction in the scale and impact of the development.

Naturally, as a result of this there will be significantly less traffic associated with this level of development at Foundry Square compared to what has previously been consented. There will be traffic generated by the foodstore, but this demand will be lower during peak PM weekday periods as shopping trips typically take place throughout the day rather than being confined to one or two peak hours and there will be many linked and pass by trips which are already on the local network. In addition, local people for whom this development is intended to serve, will choose not to travel in Hayle at the times when they perceive traffic levels to be at their highest.

The Current Proposal has 15% less traffic passing through Foundry Square compared with the Consented Masterplan. Experience across the UK shows that local people who are familiar with the characteristics of their local road network choose to travel to minimise their inconvenience.

Table 1 shows a comparison of the development within the Consented Masterplan, the Current Proposal and the Proposed Amendments.

Table 1 – Comparison of land uses for Consented Masterplan, Current Proposal and Proposed Amendments			
Land Use	Consented Masterplan (June 2010) (m² / no. of units)	Current Proposal PA10/08142 Dec 2010 (m² /no. of units)	Proposed Amendments July 2011 (m² /no. of units)
Residential	260	30	30
Retail	10,585	2,397	1,990
Business park	5,150	0	0
A3 (restaurant)	870	372	276
A3 / A4 Unit	0	0	407
Health centre	750	0	0
Community/education	1,340	0	0
Food retail	0	5,230	5,230
Cinema	0	433	0
Total Floorspace	18,695	8,432	7,903
Total parking	470	326	310

The Proposed Amendments have less floor area than the Current Proposal and so the traffic effect will be equal to or less compared to what has been previously assessed within the December 2010 Transport Assessment.

Trip Generation from the Current Proposal

A Transport Assessment (TA) has been prepared in support of the Current Proposal. The TA includes a forecast of the number of trips that are likely to be attracted to the new development.

It is worth noting that the forecast trips in the assessment for the Current Proposal are considered 'worst case'. Evidence from the industry standard software that provides data on trip rates (TRICS)



indicates that foodstore's in similar town centre or edge of centre locations will attract more than 40% of trips as non-car trips. This is a considerably lower vehicle trip rate than has been have assumed within the Transport Assessment.

Furthermore, the land uses contained within the Consented Masterplan, particularly the more significant residential and employment uses, would have attracted more peak commuter period trips than the Current Proposal. The trips associated with the Current Proposal will be more discretionary and travelers will tend to have more choice of means and times of travel for these purposes. Shoppers tend to either divert from an existing trip and are hence already on the local network as this store aims to serve the immediate catchment, or they will choose to shop at off peak times (as locals, they will appreciate the times when the network is at its busiest and shop when it is most convenient).

Since the December 2010 ING planning application one new foodstore site (Redhill, Surrey) has been added to the TRICS database and is considered to be a closer reflection to the proposals on the South Quay site. The equivalent trip rates at Redhill for the PM peak are 33% lower than were used to support the Current Proposal.

The pertinent points to note relating to trip rates / traffic generation are as follows:

The trip rates assumed for the ING foodstore are higher than the ASDA trip rates which relate to an out of town store with a Petrol Filling Station (PFS) and a store with more parking spaces (267 ING vs. 381 ASDA). Therefore the Current Proposal trip rates are robust and considered to be over cautious.

- The ASDA trip rates are significantly lower than the Sainsbury's trip rates which are more appropriate for an out of town foodstore with a PFS. This further supports the trip rates that have been applied;
- The modal split for the town centre ING trip rates are almost identical to the out of town ASDA modal split which again suggests that the ING trip rates are overly cautious;
- The new data within the TRICS database now includes a town centre site (Redhill) which provide much more appropriate trip rates and modal splits for the ING development;
- As such the forecast traffic attraction relating to the foodstore in the Dec 2010 application is a significant overestimation (potentially as much as +33%) compared with more recently published and more comparable data.

Public Realm

The juxtaposition of South Quay and the Foundry Yard to the town centre provides an opportunity to strengthen the existing connections and provide a continuous 'Town Centre' character along Carnsew Road. This improved connection reinforces the view that the site is effectively a continuation of the existing town centre. As such, a public realm improvement scheme has been devised for Carnsew Road to establish this important link between the site and Foundry Square.



The public realm improvement scheme for Carnsew Road within the Current Proposal includes:

- Realigning the road to provide a new continuous 2m wide footway along the southern edge of the road;
- Improving the pedestrian links through Isis Gardens and creating informal crossing points at the Foundry Square mini-roundabout;
- Foundry Square will be improved at a pedestrian scale;
- New 'straight across' crossings at the signal controlled site access junction;

The change in road surface materials will introduce a town centre character along this section of Carnsew Road. The widened footway will improve pedestrian accessibility between the site and the town centre. As a consequence of this widening, there will be a slight narrowing of the road lanes through the viaduct which will become a natural traffic calming feature, further reducing vehicular speeds.

A DfT document published in January 2011 (Creating Growth, Cutting Carbon – Making Sustainable Local Transport Happen), states that improvements to the public realm can increase turnover in the high street by 5-15%.

Accessibility

From a planning policy perspective and in sequential test terms, the South Quay site is clearly the most accessible site for a foodstore within Hayle.

Table 2 demonstrates the accessibility of the ING site compared to the ASDA and Morrison's sites in relation to the proximity to the number of households.

Table 2 Approximate number and % of households						
Within	Approximate number of households			% of Hayle households		
	ING South Quay	Morrisons	ASDA	ING South Quay	Morrisons	ASDA
400m	140	100	10	4%	3%	0.3%
800m	675	650	285	21%	20%	9%
1000m	1180	1135	720	37%	36%	23%
2000m	2125	2025	1575	67%	64%	49%

The Current Proposal has been designed to integrate fully with the local environment and provide a high quality mixed-use scheme. It is considered that the new waterfront regeneration will become an extension of Hayle Town Centre and its mixed-use nature will encourage a range of users, both local and tourism based. Infrastructure will be provided to encourage this connectivity. The application site is situated alongside the waterfront, the town centre and local residential areas which makes it particularly suitable for sustainable regeneration. In sustainable transport terms, this site also offers the best location for a foodstore compared with the other candidate sites within



Hayle. Many users will be able to visit the site via sustainable modes of travel, although the development is also designed to accommodate travel by private car. The site is less than 200m from the town centre and pedestrian connectivity will be significantly enhanced as part of the proposals.

The redevelopment proposals include a range of public realm improvements and new pedestrian and public transport infrastructure.

A new 3m wide pedestrian / cycle bridge is to be provided across Penpol Creek, facilitating safe movement to South Quay from Penpol Terrace. The footbridge will comply with Disability Discrimination Act (DDA) standards and will provide a new link between the site and the northern retail and residential areas of Hayle, thereby further integrating the development with the local communities. This is a significant enhancement to the local area and will create a strong and sustainable linkage between the South Quay and Foundry Yard development and other parts of the town. This is also a significant advantage of this site in comparison with other current foodstore sites or proposals within Hayle. The new bridge will enhance the attractiveness of the foodstore and associated land uses.

The Council in consultation with the local community is currently considering whether the location highlighted on the submitted application drawings is the most appropriate. The position of the bridge is subject to securing all necessary approvals and ING will be offering to make a financial contribution secured through the S106 legal agreement. Should an alternative location be deemed more suitable then the financial contribution can be used for this purpose and a revised permission can be sought.

A new signal controlled junction will provide access to South Quay and Foundry Yard and includes 'straight across' pedestrian crossing facilities which will operate on an 'all red' signal phase, whereby traffic flows on all arms are stopped by pedestrians calling for the phase by a push-button. This will prevent the phase being called unnecessarily and reducing the traffic capacity along Carnsew Road.

Whilst the Morrison's site is only marginally less well located than South Quay to the immediate local community, it is not able to deliver the public realm improvements that will facilitate easy connectivity to local people or, more importantly the pedestrian / cycle links to the town centre that are so important to existing retailers and business in securing linked trips.

Impact on the Local Road Network

It is acknowledged that the majority of food-based trips made by Hayle residents are made to other places where food retailers are located i.e. St Ives, Penzance and Camborne. As such there is already foodstore traffic on the Strategic Road Network (SRN) as a consequence of this leakage. Therefore a foodstore within Hayle will provide containment for many of these existing food based trips currently made via the SRN to food retailers in other locations. In this instance there will be a net beneficial effect on the A30 as existing foodstore trips onto the SRN are removed and kept within the local highway network in Hayle. This will result in a reduction in traffic of -2.4% at Loggans Moor and -3.8% at St Erth roundabout junctions.

On a local level it is fundamentally important to understand that the other foodstore proposals within Hayle such as Morrisons and ASDA will create new trips onto the network as they will be in addition to traffic which can come forward from the extant planning permission on South Quay (it is to be noted that should the Current Proposal not be approved these competing proposals would have to assume that the traffic associated with the consented development will exist). It is acknowledged that the ING proposals will have an impact locally above current (2011) traffic levels, however not against the base plus Consented Masterplan traffic levels as the Current Proposals will have subsumed that original consent. The Morrisons and ASDA proposals will add to the impact of the Consented Masterplan.

The total demand on the local highway network from the Current Proposals is circa 875 two-way trips during the PM peak. This level of demand is not uncommon for developments of this nature, however only some 530 of these trips are actually new trips. The remainder are already travelling on the local highway network and passing through the Foundry Square junction and consist of diverted and pass by trips. These traffic demand forecasts have been derived using widely accepted methodologies and research relating to traffic patterns associated with retail / food retail developments. However, the approach that has been adopted in this regard is also considered by the applicant and the Council to be overly cautious and the reality is that many of the trips associated with this foodstore will already be on the network and not primary trips.

Locally, the primary concern appears to relate to the free flow of traffic (avoidance of congestion), the safety of pedestrians and cyclists and the removal of unnecessary traffic from the centre, especially HGVs and the creation of a non car dominated environment around Foundry Square.

There is a perception amongst supporters of competing foodstores within Hayle, that the local network will be brought to a standstill following the development of a foodstore on the ING site and this is totally unfounded (in fact the local road network would be considerably more congested if either of the competing schemes was to be approved and the ING regeneration were to proceed as permitted). Similarly there is a view from these people that on street parking would need to be removed in order to generate additional road space to facilitate free flow of traffic is again, wholly unfounded and would be against Local and National policy.

It is also fundamentally important to understand that any local perceptions of issues relating to existing congestion within Hayle may only occur during only a few months of the year corresponding with the summer season and increased tourism and visitors in this part of Cornwall. This is not a constant phenomenon throughout the year and the income to the town derived during these peak periods is significant to the vitality of Hayle i.e. the town needs a high level of visitors to sustain and grow economically and this inevitably leads to an increase in volumes of traffic. As well as having detrimental traffic impacts due to their unsustainable locations, foodstores located on the outskirts of Hayle will draw vitality and the economy away from the town centre.

Furthermore, the perception of congestion within Hayle during these peak periods is significantly different to the perception of congestion elsewhere within the UK.

Importantly, all of the traffic surveys undertaken along Carnsew Road and at Foundry Square and including the video surveys in support of the Current Proposals show no congestion during peak times. This includes the May Bank Holiday from which the traffic forecasts and assessment were based. This is one of the busiest times of the year when it would not be considered unreasonable to assume that the town would attract a greater amount of visitors and hence traffic compared to normal conditions.

As part of the development proposals, additional traffic capacity will be provided at the Foundry Square junction. It is proposed to provide a modest, yet viable solution to increase capacity at the Foundry Square junction which involves increasing the entry widths at the junction. These capacity improvements can be undertaken whilst ensuring that there is no detriment to the pedestrian environment or public realm at this location. These works would have minimal impact on the recent public realm improvements that have taken place in this area. In addition, these improvements will provide capacity benefits to the junction to 2017.

There is often a lack of understanding of town centre dynamics in terms of background traffic and traffic from new development. It would be fundamentally wrong to seek to provide for unfettered demand, i.e a demand which is totally unconstrained, from a new town centre development which during certain times of the year can experience traffic congestion. If every development was appraised on that basis it is likely that the theoretical capacity of the road would be exceeded and no development of existing town centres would go ahead. This does not happen and such an approach would be contrary to regeneration policies.

Parking

The Current Proposal for development on South Quay and Foundry Yard contains the following breakdown of parking.

- 267 spaces on South Quay for the foodstore, cinema and ancillary uses including retail.
- 30 spaces for the residential development
- 43 spaces located on Foundry Yard

In addition, the access road into the foodstore car park has been designed to be sufficiently long enough to accommodate approximately 30 queuing vehicles.. In reality, this is unlikely to happen but the access road provides a level of comfort that a number of vehicles could be stored there whilst vehicles manoeuvred through the car park during peak periods and consequently, not block any through traffic on Carnsew Road.

In practice these car parks, which are in a prime location in the town centre of Hayle, will attract traffic in their own right if not managed correctly. However, these car parks have never been promoted as an additional town centre car park or one which should be designed to meet the aspirational needs of the town.

Therefore, the unfettered demand can be much higher than the number of spaces, as may be the case with any Hayle Town Centre car park. To mitigate this, the proposal will need to be accompanied by a robust car park management system, which by pricing will favour users of

facilities on the site over others. By management and pricing, as well as by size, the car park will limit the site's attraction in the weekday lunchtime peak time. The system of control is likely to be one of charging for parking and reimbursement at the point of sale within the development. It is expected that this can be dealt with by way of planning condition.

There will be periods throughout the day when the demand from the foodstore and ancillary development declines and during these times there will be surplus car parking available for other town centre or leisure uses.

Summary and Conclusion

South Quay is acknowledged as being the best available site in Hayle for a foodstore in sequential terms and in terms of sustainable linkages, the location within the town centre and minimising impact on the Strategic Road Network (A30). This accords with National, Regional and Local policy objectives for transportation and land-use planning. The redevelopment of a brownfield site in a prominent position within the town centre offers future customers a real opportunity to travel to the site by sustainable modes and future residents less dependent on private motorised vehicles.

In addition to this, the redevelopment proposals include a new public realm improvement scheme which will strengthen the existing pedestrian links along Carnsew Road whilst enhancing the connectivity of the site to the town centre. Effectively the site will become an extension of the town centre.

Further significant improvements to local sustainable transport infrastructure are proposed, which include;

- A new pedestrian/cycle footbridge that will link the site with north Hayle, shortening the walking distance to the site by approximately 400m. The Council in consultation with the local community is currently considering whether the location highlighted on the submitted application drawings is the most appropriate. The position of the bridge is subject to securing all necessary approvals and ING will be offering to make a financial contribution secured through the S106 legal agreement. Should an alternative location be deemed more suitable then the financial contribution can be used for this purpose and a revised permission can be sought;
- A new pedestrian connection through Isis Gardens, providing better pedestrian permeability through the existing viaduct structure and further improving links between the town centre and the site;
- New 'straight-across' signal-controlled pedestrian crossings on all of the arms of the site access junction;
- The Current proposal will have 15% less traffic passing through Foundry Square compared with the Consented Masterplan but will also provide additional traffic capacity at this junction with minor amendments to the geometry.

The Proposed Amendments to the Masterplan for South Quay in direct response to the reasons for deferral in February 2011 have now manifest themselves in a reduction in floor space compared to

the Current Proposals. Therefore there will be equal or less traffic effect than previously assessed in the December 2010 TA.

The proposed food store will significantly decrease the leakage from Hayle residents to other food stores in towns such as Camborne and Penzance. As such, the containment of trips to the food stores will be kept within Hayle. Given the town centre location, many trips can be made sustainably. Moreover, a foodstore development in this location will reduce the existing food shopping impact on the strategic highway (A30) network as residents will no longer need to travel to other towns for their shopping. There will be a reduction in traffic compared with existing levels of 2.4% and 3.8% at St Erth and Loggans Moor junctions with the A30 respectively.

The Current Proposals present a real opportunity to deliver a prestigious and sustainable development which offers tangible infrastructure benefits as well as providing a range of retail and other uses.